## Case 1:17-cv-08919-PGG Document 21 Filed 07/27/18 Page 1 of 16

## THE LAW OFFICES OF MARTIN E. RESTITUYO, P.C.

1345 Avenue of the Americas, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, New York, New York 10105

Martin E. Restituyo Tel: 212-729-7900 Fax: 212-729-7490 restituyo@restituyolaw.com

July 27, 2018

#### VIA ECF Filing

Hon. Paul G. Gardephe United States District Court Judge Thurgood Marshall United States Courthouse 40 Foley Square, Room 705 New York, NY 10007

Re: Fitz v. Bethel Gourmet Food Corp., CA No. 17-cv-08919

## Dear Judge Gardephe:

As per the Court's order of July 17, 2018 [Dkt #20] Plaintiffs hereby propose the appointment of Mark S. Gottlieb as the independent auditor to review Defendants' finances as per the settlement agreement in this case. Annexed herewith please find Mr. Gottlieb's resume and his firm's fee schedule.

We thank the Court for allowing us to participate in the selection process.

Should the Court require additional information, please advise so that we may provide accordingly.

Very truly yours

Martin E. Restituyo, Esq.

#### **BACKGROUND**

With over 30 years of experience, Mark S. Gottlieb is an accomplished forensic accounting and business valuation specialist with expertise in record reconstruction and litigation support. Mr. Gottlieb is recognized for the meticulous preparation and comprehensive research he brings to all of his professional engagements. Since forming MSGCPA, Mr. Gottlieb has lead a team of highly qualified professionals in conducting forensic accounting examinations, independent business and professional practice valuations, and a continuum of financial and economic analyses. He is frequently appointed by the court to provide these services and expert testimony. Mr. Gottlieb has also lectured extensively to many government agencies and professional organizations on accounting, tax, economic development and valuation/appraisal issues. Previously, Mr. Gottlieb was employed by the international accounting and consulting firms of PriceWaterhouseCoopers (formally Coopers & Lybrand) and Ernst & Young (formally Ernst & Whinney).

#### **EDUCATION**

- Bachelor of Business Administration in Accounting Adelphi University (May 1983)
- Master of Science in Taxation Long Island University (May 1993)

#### PROFESSIONAL MEMBERSHIPS

- State of New York Grievance Committee for the Tenth Judicial District – Committee Member (2015 to Present)
- Brandeis Association Scholarship Fund Treasurer (2015 to Present)
- New York State Society of Certified Public Accountants –
   Business Valuation Committee Member (2013 to Present)
- New York State Society of Certified Public Accountants Litigation Support Committee Member (2013 to Present)
- Institute of Business Appraisals Education Board (2011 to 2012)
- New York State Society of Certified Public Accountants –
   Mediation and Arbitration Committee Member (2002)
- Five Towns Community Chest Treasurer (2001)
- Bar Association of Nassau County We Care Fund (2000 to 2010)
- Great Neck Chamber of Commerce (2000 to 2002)
- Great Neck Lawyers Association (1999 to 2002)



# MARK S. GOTTLIEB



Email: msgcpa@msgcpa.com

#### **Areas of Expertise**

- Business Valuation
- Forensic Accounting
- Litigation Support
- Expert Witness

# Licenses, Accreditations and Certifications

- Certified Public Accountant (CPA) in New York and Connecticut
- Accredited in Business Valuation (ABV)
- Certified in Financial Forensics (CFF)
- Certified Valuation Analyst (CVA)
- Certified Business Appraiser (CBA)

MARK S. GOTTLIEB, CPA, PC

www.msgcpa.com

Tel: 646-661-3800 Fax: 646-661-3801

MARK S. GOTTLIEB CPA/ABV/CFF, CVA, CBA, MST PAGE 2 OF 14

## **FACULTY POSITIONS**

- New York Law School, Adjunct Professor (Fall 2003 to Fall 2006)
- European School of Economics, Adjunct Professor (Fall 2006)
- Pace University, Adjunct Professor (Summer 1997)

#### **PROFESSIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

- American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
- New York State Society of Certified Public Accountants
- National Association of Certified Valuation Analysts
- Institute of Business Appraisers

## **SPEAKING ENGAGEMENTS (Condensed Summary)**

2	n	4	C

2016	
June, 2016	Business Valuation: Litigation, Arbitration and Mediation Strategies for Getting the Right Price
	New York County Lawyers' Association, New York, New York
June, 2016	Finding the Money – What Divorce Attorneys Should Know
	Rockland County Bar Association, New City, New York
May, 2016	Advanced Risk Issues in Business Valuations
	New York State Society of CPAs, New York, New York
April, 2016	Advanced Risk Issues in Business Valuations
	American Society of Appraisers – Philadelphia Chapter, Plymouth Meeting, Pennsylvania
2015	
November, 2015	Advanced Risk Issues in Business Valuations
	Business Valuation Resources, Webinar
October, 2015	Finding Hidden Treasures in Tax Returns
	Certified Divorce Financial Analyst Annual Conference, New York, New York
March, 2015	Finding Hidden Treasures in Tax Returns
	Rockland County Bar Association, New City, New York
2014	
October, 2014	Forensic Accounting & Income Tax Issues Related To Divorce
	New York Society of Independent Accountants, Elmsford, New York
June, 2014	Forensic Accounting in A Litigation Environment
	Brooklyn Bar Association, Brooklyn, New York



## Case 1:17-cv-08919-PGG Document 21 Filed 07/27/18 Page 4 of 16

MARK S. GOTTLIEB CPA/ABV/CFF, CVA, CBA, MST PAGE 3 OF 14

April, 2014 Introduction to Business Valuation

University at Albany, Albany, New York

February, 2014 Fundamentals of Business Valuation

Rockland County Bar Association, New City, New York

January, 2014 Lifestyle Analysis in Matrimonial Actions

New York City Bar Association, New York, New York

2013

September, 2013 Lifestyle Analysis in Matrimonial Actions

Rockland County Bar Association, Rockland, New York

2012

June, 2012 Financial Boot Camp for Matrimonial Attorneys

Melville Marriott Long Island, Melville, New York

March, 2012 Divorce Attorney's Guide to Reading Financial Statements

Mark S. Gottlieb, CPA, PC Great Neck, New York

January, 2012 Hot Issues in Valuing Businesses for A Divorce

Collaborative Divorce Attorneys of Fairfield County, Stamford, Connecticut

2010

October, 2010 Lifestyle Analysis in Matrimonial Actions

Fairfield County Bar Association, Stamford, Connecticut

September, 2010 Lifestyle Analysis in Matrimonial Actions

Brooklyn Bar Association, Brooklyn, New York

2007

July, 2007 Valuing Closely Held Businesses

National Business Institute, State Bank of Long Island, Melville, New York

June, 2007 The Forensic Accountant's Role In Divorce Engagements

Pace University Law School, White Plains, New York

2006

December, 2006 Valuing a Law Practice

Nassau County Bar Association, Mineola, New York



2005

October, 2005 Forensic Accounting for Business Appraisers

International Business Brokers Association Incorporated, Las Vegas, Nevada

2003

December, 2003 Forensic Accounting Opportunities for CPAs

Tax & Accounting Institute, Brookville, New York

October, 2003 Forensic Accounting: An Overview for the Practicing Attorney

Nassau County Bar Association, Mineola, New York

October, 2003 Forensic Accounting: An Overview for the Practicing Attorney

Suffolk County Bar Association, Hauppauge, New York

September, 2003 Forensic Accounting: An Overview for the Practicing Attorney

Brooklyn County Bar Association, Brooklyn, New York

September, 2003 Forensic Accounting: An Overview for the Practicing Attorney

Queens County Bar Association, Jamaica, New York

2002

September, 2002 Appraising Law Firms

New York State Society of CPAs, New York, New York

May, 2002 Appraising Law Firms

Nassau County Bar Association, Mineola, New York

2001

December, 2001 Business Valuations for Estate & Gift Tax

Tax & Accounting Institute, Brookville, New York

1990 – 2001 Small Business Tax Workshop

Internal Revenue Service

1990- 2001 Tax Workshop

New York State Department of Taxation and Finance, Albany, New York

1990 – 2001 Self-Employment Program Training

New York State Department of Labor, Albany, New York



## Case 1:17-cv-08919-PGG Document 21 Filed 07/27/18 Page 6 of 16

MARK S. GOTTLIEB CPA/ABV/CFF, CVA, CBA, MST PAGE 5 OF 14

1999

November, 1999 Valuing Professional Practices and Licenses

Richmond County Bar Association, Staten Island, New York

October, 1999 Entrepreneurial Assistance Program

Brooklyn Economic Development Corporation, New York, New York

September, 1999 Methods of Valuing a Business

Business Outreach Center, Corona, New York

March, 1999 Business Valuations for Estate & Gift Tax

Nassau County Bar Association, Mineola, New York

March, 1999 Getting Down For Business Forum

New York City Department of Business Services, New York, New York

February, 1999 Advanced Issues of Managed Care & What It Means to Physicians Practicing in

New York

SouthShore PPO Incorporated, Woodmere, New York

February, 1999 All about Appraisals: An Aid for Litigators

Suffolk County Bar Association, Hauppauge, New York

## **BLOG PUBLICATIONS (available at www.msgcpa.com)**

2016

June, 2016 Discretionary Expenses in Business Valuations

April, 2016 Dealing with Fraud: A Simple Four Step System

April, 2016 A Business Valuation Analysis Can Help Increase the Value of Your Business

February, 2016 Valuing Covenants Not to Compete

2015

April, 2015 Types of Fraud in Business

February, 2015 Estate Tax Strategies for Second Marriages

February, 2015 5 Services Forensic Accountants Provide During a Matrimonial Dispute That May

Surprise You

February, 2015 Hidden Taxes in Divorce



# Case 1:17-cv-08919-PGG Document 21 Filed 07/27/18 Page 7 of 16

MARK S. GOTTLIEB CPA/ABV/CFF, CVA, CBA, MST PAGE 6 OF 14

January, 2015	Why You Should Farm Out Business Valuation to Specialty Firms
<b>2014</b> November, 2014	Cross-Examining a Financial Expert – Part 1
October, 2014	Understanding Risk in Business Valuation
October, 2014	Transfer Pricing and Related Valuation Issues
October, 2014	Top 10 Thing Attorneys Need at the Start of Matrimonial Action
October, 2014	Lifestyle Analysis
October, 2014	Goodwill Impairment Testing
October, 2014	Hidden Treasures in Tax Returns
October, 2014	A Guide of Fairness Opinions
October, 2014	Identifying Business Perks
October, 2014	Imputed Income: Definition, Calculation, and Evidence
October, 2014	The Fraud Triangle
October, 2014	Calculating Economic Damages
September, 2014	Cash Businesses and Divorce
September, 2014	Normalizing Owners' Compensation in Business Valuation
March, 2014	Using Business Valuation Experts to Your Best Advantage in Divorce
March, 2014	A Panel Discussion on Proposed Maintenance Guidelines.
February, 2014	Uncovering & Understanding Hidden Fees in a 401(k) Plan with Miriam Schindel, Esq.
February, 2014	An Attorney's Guide to Same-Sex Marriage Tax Issues."
<b>2013</b> February, 2013	An Attorney's Guide to Understanding Business Valuation Standards



# Case 1:17-cv-08919-PGG Document 21 Filed 07/27/18 Page 8 of 16

MARK S. GOTTLIEB CPA/ABV/CFF, CVA, CBA, MST PAGE 7 OF 14

March, 2013	Using Business Valuation Experts to Your Best Advantage in Divorce
<b>2011</b> September, 2011	An Attorney's Guide to the Recent IRS Changes Regarding Innocent Spouse Relief
March, 2011	Valuing Small Businesses
February, 2011	The Joint Appraiser's Role in a Divorce Action
February, 2011	Valuation Issues in the Bankruptcy Process
January, 2011	8 Minefields Attorneys Should Avoid Before Presenting Your Valuation Report to the Court
January, 2011	Fraud in the Workplace
<b>2010</b> December, 2010	Cliff Lee's Earnings Capacity Is At Its Peak. Would He Be Able to Keep It All If He Divorced In New York?
November, 2010	An Attorney's Guide To Divorce-Related Tax Issues
October, 2010	New York State's New Legislation Impacts the Financial Concerns of Family Law
September, 2010	Determining Lost Profit v. Lost Business from the Financial Expert's Perspective
August, 2010	Hiring a Forensic Expert Early in a Lost Profits Case Yields High Dividends
July, 2010	Finding Hidden Treasures in Tax Returns
July, 2010	The Honorable Sondra Miller's Take on No-Fault Divorce
June, 2010	New York State Senate's Democratic Majority Passes Legislative Package to Approve No-Fault Divorce
June, 2010	Panel of Experts Discuss New York State's Current Legislation to Develop Maintenance/Alimony Guidelines
April, 2010	Major Changes in New Jersey's Palimony Law
April, 2010	Madoff Scam Hits Divorce Court



## Case 1:17-cv-08919-PGG Document 21 Filed 07/27/18 Page 9 of 16

MARK S. GOTTLIEB CPA/ABV/CFF, CVA, CBA, MST PAGE 8 OF 14

April, 2010 Proposed Changes to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26

April, 2010 Merger and Acquisition Disputes in Challenging Economic Times

March, 2010 Parenting Plans Considerations When Divorcing

March, 2010 Defining Fair Value in Shareholder Disputes

INDUSTRY STUDIES (available at www.msgcpa.com)

Accounting Electrical Contracting Metal Services

Anesthesiology Executive Recruiting Physician

Audio & Video Grocery Stores Refrigerated Warehousing

Postproduction

Healthcare Administration Security

Check Cashing

Home Health Care Specialty Food

**Commercial Construction** 

Jewelry – Retail Steel

Day Camp

Landscape Counseling Ticket Brokerage

**Drug Stores** 

Laundromat Youth Athletics

**Drug Testing** 

Medical & Diagnostic

eBay Laboratories

#### WHITEPAPER PUBLICATIONS (available at www.msgcpa.com)

**Business Valuation** 

November, 2014 8 Minefields to Avoid before Presenting Your Valuation Report to the Court Cross

**Examining a Financial Expert** 

November, 2014 Valuation Issues in the Bankruptcy Process

October, 2014 Identifying Business Perks

October, 2014 An Attorney's Guide to Understanding Business Valuation Standards

September, 2014 Normalizing Owners' Compensation in Business Valuation



## Case 1:17-cv-08919-PGG Document 21 Filed 07/27/18 Page 10 of 16

MARK S. GOTTLIEB CPA/ABV/CFF, CVA, CBA, MST PAGE 9 OF 14

September, 2014 Why You Should Farm Out Business Valuation to Specialty Firms

February, 2014 Understanding Risk in Business Valuation

December, 2013 Valuing Small Businesses

August, 2008 Understanding Risk in Business Valuation Study

**Economic Damages** 

November, 2014 Hiring a Forensic Expert Early in a Lost Profits Case Yields High Dividends

October, 2014 Calculating Economic Damages

**Financial Advisory** 

October, 2014 Transfer Pricing and Related Valuation Issues

October, 2014 Goodwill Impairment Testing

February, 2014 A Guide to Fairness Opinions

December, 2013 Merger and Acquisition Disputes in Challenging Economic Times

November, 2011 An Attorney's Guide to Fairness Opinion

September, 2011 IRS Job Aid Resource Guide

June, 2011 Uncovering & Understanding Hidden Fees in a 401(K) Plan with Miriam Schindel,

Esq.

**Forensic Accounting** 

October, 2014 Fraud in the Workplace

June, 2014 Determining Lost Profit v. Lost Business from the Financial Expert's Perspective

**Matrimonial & Divorce** 

December, 2014 Estate Tax Strategies for Second Marriages

December, 2014 Hidden Taxes in Divorce

November, 2014 5 Litigation Services Forensic Accountants Provide During a Matrimonial Dispute

That May Surprise You



# Case 1:17-cv-08919-PGG Document 21 Filed 07/27/18 Page 11 of 16

MARK S. GOTTLIEB CPA/ABV/CFF, CVA, CBA, MST PAGE 10 OF 14

October, 2014	A Practical Resource for all Matrimonial Attorneys – In 3 Parts
October, 2014	Top 10 Things Attorneys Need at the Start of Matrimonial Action
September, 2014	Cash Businesses and Divorce
February, 2014	Using Business Valuation Experts to Your Best Advantage in Divorce
February, 2014	An Attorney's Guide to Divorce-Related Tax Issues
February, 2014	The Joint Appraiser's Role in a Divorce Action
December, 2013	Enhanced Earnings Capacity
December, 2013	An Attorney's Guide to Same-Sex Marriage Tax Issues
December, 2013	An Attorney's Guide to the Recent IRS Changes Regarding Innocent Spouse Relief
June, 2012	An Attorney's Guide to Enhanced Earnings Capacity Part 1
February, 2012	Joint Appraisers Role in a Divorce Action
January, 2012	Same-Sex Marriage Tax Consequences
November, 2011	Innocent Spouse Relief
September, 2011	Matrimonial Resource Guide
July, 2011	Attorney's Guide to Divorce Related Tax Issues
December, 2010	Cliff Lee's Earnings Capacity Is At Its Peak. Would He Be Able to Keep It All If He Divorced in New York?
October, 2010	New York State Senate's Democratic Majority Passes Legislative Package to Approve No-Fault Divorce
July, 2010	The Honorable Sondra Miller's Take on No-Fault Divorce
April, 2010	Major Changes in New Jersey's Palimony Law
March, 2010	Parenting Plans Considerations When Divorcing



## Case 1:17-cv-08919-PGG Document 21 Filed 07/27/18 Page 12 of 16

MARK S. GOTTLIEB CPA/ABV/CFF, CVA, CBA, MST PAGE 11 OF 14

January, 2010 Madoff Scam Hits the Divorce Court

December, 2008 Sample Lifestyle Analysis Report

January, 2008 Finding Hidden Treasures in Tax Returns

**Shareholder Disputes** 

October, 2014 The Fraud Triangle

October, 2014 Imputed Income: Definition, Calculation, and Evidence

September, 2014 Farming Out Business Valuation to Specialty Firms

January, 2010 Defining Fair Value in Shareholder Disputes

PODCASTS (available at www.msgcpa.com)

**Business Valuation** 

June 1, 2011 Understanding Risk in Business Valuation

**Financial Advisory** 

December 3, 2010 An Attorney's Guide to Cross Examining Financial Expert Witnesses with Mark

H. Sobel, Esq.

June 29, 2010 Uncovering & Understanding Hidden Fees in a 401(K) Plan with Miriam Schindel,

Esq.

April 22, 2010 Whistleblower Claims with Ellen August, Esq.

**Divorce & Matrimony** 

June 1, 2011 Finding Hidden Treasures in Tax Returns - Related to the Divorce Process

May 12, 2011 Divorce Mediation with Alan S. Rubenstein, Esq.

October 19, 2010 2010 Changes to New York Divorce Laws with Henry Berman, Esq.

June 29, 2010 NYS Senate Approves Legislation to Permit No-Fault Divorce with the

Honorable Sondra Miller

May 12, 2010 New Palimony Law in New Jersey with Stephanie Hagan, Esq.

March 23, 2010 Divorce During an Economic Downturn with Sherri Donovan, Esq.



## Case 1:17-cv-08919-PGG Document 21 Filed 07/27/18 Page 13 of 16

MARK S. GOTTLIEB CPA/ABV/CFF, CVA, CBA, MST PAGE 12 OF 14

March 19, 2010 Initial Documents for a Divorce with Eric Broder, Esq.

March 6, 2010 The Madoff Mess Hits Divorce Court with Eric Solotoff, Esq.

March 6, 2010 Parenting Plans with Leonard G. Florescue, Esq.

January 25, 2010 Prenuptial Agreements-Financial Considerations for Attorneys

**Shareholder Disputes** 

March 23, 2010 NJ Bar Looks to Modify LLC Act With Daniel Gielchinsky, Esq.

March 6, 2010 Fair Value with Peter Mahler, Esq.

**Economic Damages** 

April 9, 2010 Determining Economic Damages

**PUBLICATION CONTRIBUTIONS** 

January 4, 2012 IRS Eases Restrictions on 'Innocent Spouse' Tax Cases by Tim Grant

Pittsburgh Post-Gazette

August 30, 2007 Jewelers Post Same-Store Sales, Earnings by David Koenig

Associated Press

August 30, 2007 Tiffany, Zale Report Profits, Earnings by David Koenig

Associated Press

July 13, 2007 Accountants: Always Check the Claims by Carrie Mason-Draffen

Newsday

January 21, 2007 Accountants in Demand, Companies are Hungry for Qualified Candidates as

Government Rules Keep Numbers-Crunchers Busy by Carrie Mason-Draffen

Newsday, pp. F6

July 27, 2003 Tracking Down Wrong Numbers - Forensic Accountants Are Increasingly On the

Case Uncovering Corporate Misdeeds by Carrie Mason-Draffen

Newsday, pp. F4

June 12, 2000 Accounting for Tastes: Firms Vary the Mix by Laurie Joan Aron

Crain's New York Business, pp. 26

September 28, 1998 Accountant's New Practices Put Price on Businesses by Susan Kleinman

Crain's New York Business, pp. 14



MARK S. GOTTLIEB CPA/ABV/CFF, CVA, CBA, MST PAGE 13 OF 14

September 1, 1997	Network Strives to Rebuild Industrial Base by Michael Hirsch Crain's New York Business, pp. 16
March 10, 1997	No ifs, ands or UBTs in City? Mayor Wants to Curb Tax by Cara S. Trager Crain's New York Business
December 9, 1996	Simple Plan May Lead to Easy St. by Lisa Goff  Crain's New York Business
October 7, 1996	Citi Banks on PC Product to Lure Small Businesses by Frederick Gabriel Crain's New York Business
September, 1996	By Setting up Spending Plan, Owners Can Cash in on Success by Lisa Goff Crain's New York Business
July 29, 1996	Chase Slashes Banking Fees for Small Business by Frederick Gabriel Crain's New York Business
June 10, 1996	Banks See Fall Off in Small Firm Loans by Frederick Gabriel  Crain's New York Business
February, 1996	What's the IRS Holdup? by Patricia M. Carey Home Office Computing, pp. 38
February, 1996	Don't Rush To Spend Windfall by Lisa Goff  Crain's New York Business
October 2, 1995	BONY Breaks Big Push to Lure Small Business by Frederick Gabriel Crain's New York Business
July 24, 1995	IDing Contractors and IRS Obsession by Patricia M. Carey Crain's New York Business
July 24, 1995	Outfits Ride Coattails of Acquisition Fever by O.P. Malik  Crain's New York Business
March, 1995	When Firms Sit on Tax They Cross a Fine Line by Matthew Flamm Crain's Small Business, pp. 4, 16
April 3, 1992	Starting Your Own Business by Caryn Eve Murray Newsday, pp. 29



MARK S. GOTTLIEB CPA/ABV/CFF, CVA, CBA, MST **PAGE 14 OF 14** 

#### **MEDIA APPEARANCES**

March, 1997 The Morning Show

Mr. Gottlieb was interviewed to discuss Mayor Rudy Giuliani's proposal to curb

the New York City Unincorporated Business Tax.

June, 1995 Bloomberg Morning News, June 1995

Mr. Gottlieb was interviewed to discuss whether a balanced budget or tax cut

would best stimulate the economy.

**NEW YORK, NY** 1430 BROADWAY, SUITE 902, NEW YORK, NY 10018 TEL: 646-661-3800 / 516-829-4936 / FAX: 646-661-3801

White Plains, NY 50 Main Street **Suite 1000** White Plains, NY 10606

Tel: 914-294-4300 Fax: 914-294-5302

Stamford, CT **One Stamford Plaza** 263 Tresser Boulevard, 9th Floor Stamford, CT 06901 Tel: 203-357-1500

Fax: 203-357-1505

Roseland, NJ 101 Eisenhower Parkway Suite 300 Roseland, NJ 07068 Tel: 973-226-4500 Fax: 973-226-4508



# **SECTION III: FEE and BILLING**

**Hourly Billing Rates:** Our fees are based on the amount of time we spend working on the engagement. Hourly rates charged by other associates and professionals in our firm are as follows:

Mark S. Gottlieb \$425.00
Para-professional \$75.00
Accountant/Valuation Analyst \$95.00 to \$325.00

**Testimony: Fees:** Fees to testify and or appear in court will be based upon a flat fee of \$2,500 per half day, payable in advance.